

7-1-2008

Why did you cite...?

Research Trends Editorial Board

Follow this and additional works at: <https://www.researchtrends.com/researchtrends>

Recommended Citation

Research Trends Editorial Board (2008) "Why did you cite...?," *Research Trends*: Vol. 1 : Iss. 6 , Article 12.
Available at: <https://www.researchtrends.com/researchtrends/vol1/iss6/12>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Research Trends. It has been accepted for inclusion in Research Trends by an authorized editor of Research Trends. For more information, please contact r.herbert@elsevier.com.

Expert opinion

Continued from page 2

He continues, "Good departments don't measure applicants or staff by arbitrary calculations at all. All universities should select by references and assessment of papers, and those that already do so should publicly declare this to ease the fears of applicants."

In an essay by Eugene Garfield published on its website, Thomson Scientific itself addresses the scope of the IF and the potential for misuse. "Thomson Scientific does not depend on the Impact Factor alone in assessing the usefulness of a journal, and neither should anyone else," it says (4). It recognizes that while the IF has in recent years been increasingly used in the process of academic evaluation, the metric continues to provide an approximation of the prestige of the journals in which individuals have been published and is not an assessment tool for the individuals themselves.

Metrics will never be able to provide a holistic picture of an individual scientist or journal and should certainly not determine science. However, they can function as an initial indicator, thereby providing a starting point for further discussion or assessment.

References:

(1) Garfield, E. (2005) "The agony and the ecstasy: the history and meaning of the Journal Impact Factor". *International Congress on Peer Review and Biomedical Publication, Chicago, September 16, 2005.*

(2) Colquhoun, D. (2003) "Challenging the tyranny of impact factors". *Nature, Correspondence, 423, 479.*

(3) Colquhoun, D. (2007) "How should universities be run to get the best out of people?". *Physiology News, Vol. 69, pp. 12-14.*

(4) Garfield, E., "The Thomson Scientific Impact Factor"

Photograph of David Colquhoun © Mark Thomas

Why did you cite...?



Why did you cite...?

More than 913,700 French articles are referenced in Scopus. Of these, "*Note préliminaire sur le traitement des angiomes vertébraux par vertébroplastie acrylique percutanée*" (1) is ranked as the most cited article, with more than 500 citations to date.

To gain some insight into what makes a successful non-English paper, we asked the authors and those who have cited the paper frequently why they thought this paper had such an impact. The unanimous response was that the main reason for citing the article so frequently was because it represented a landmark in the field and was the first to describe a technique that was adopted internationally in the years thereafter.

One of the authors, Professor Deramond from CHU Amiens, says: "It is the first article describing the original vertebroplasty technique [...]. A considerable number of articles [...] focus on this minimally invasive therapeutic method [...] [hence the article] is cited systematically."

Frequent citers agree with this. Dr. Pflugmacher, from the University of Berlin, says that "the article is cited several times because it is the origin of vertebroplasty." Dr. Liebermann of the Cleveland Clinic, Dr. Burton from the University of Texas and Dr. Jensen from the University of Virginia expressed very similar views.

Effect of language on diffusion

It seems, however, that the fact that the article was written in French was rather an obstacle to its early diffusion. Professor Deramond notes that "it wasn't until 1997 and the publication of an article in the *American Journal of Neuroradiology* that vertebroplasty became really recognized and spread worldwide." One of the other authors, Professor Le Gars from CHU Amiens, stresses: "This article is often cited because it is the first to describe the vertebroplasty technique, devised in our hospital and now used worldwide. This is what explains the high number of cites, the usage of the French language in an Anglo-Saxon world being rather a penalizing factor."

Professor Belkoff, a frequent citer from the John Hopkins Medical Center, adds: "Vertebroplasty would have become the mainstream practice that it is perhaps 10 years earlier, had the article been written in English. If it were not for Jacques Dion, a French Canadian, hearing about vertebroplasty presented in French at a meeting of radiologists, the introduction of vertebroplasty to the US may have taken even longer. Jacques brought back what he learned to UVA, where he and colleagues Mary Jensen, John Mathis and Avery Evans used it and started spreading the word."

Reference:

(1) Galibert, P., Deramond, H., Rosat, P., Le Gars, D. (1987) "*Note préliminaire sur le traitement des angiomes vertébraux par vertébroplastie acrylique percutanée*". *Neurochirurgie, Vol. 33, No. 2, pp. 166-168.*